The role of alternative combustion vehicles and the modal changes on the path to decarbonizing road transport

Verónica Valencia-Hernández	Santiago Arango-Aramburo	Yris Olaya-Morales
Facultad de Minas	Facultad de Minas	Facultad de Minas
Universidad Nacional	Universidad Nacional	Universidad Nacional
de Colombia, Medellin.	de Colombia, Medellin.	de Colombia, Medellin.
vvalenciah@unal.edu.co	saarango@unal.edu.co	volavam@unal.edu.co

Keywords: Electric mobility, sustainable transport, development countries transport, simulation.

Funding Source: This paper has been supported by the project "Estrategia de transformación del sector energético colombiano en el horizonte 2030", financed by the Colombian Ministry of Science (MINCIENCIAS) under the Colombia Científica program (contract number FP44842-210-2018).

Extended abstract:

Although the transportation sector has mediated the economic development of nations and the exchange of goods and services, it is directly responsible for problems such as pollution by particulate matter and emissions. The transportation sector consumes 65% of petroleum products worldwide (IEA, 2019) and is responsible for 24% of direct emissions of CO_2 from fuel combustion (IEA, 2020) and 10% of the total anthropogenic emissions of PM_{10} and $PM_{2.5}$ (IEA, 2018). The environmental pressure due to pollution in cities made it essential to think of new ways of conceiving transportation systems around the world. In Colombia, the transportation sector consumes 43% of the country's energy (UPME, 2019) and represents 10% of greenhouse gas emissions (IDEAM & PNUD, 2016).

Colombia has taken steps to lead the transition to low-carbon transport and consolidate a comprehensive sustainable transport strategy. The political goal of decarbonization of transport was defined by CONPES 3934 of 2018, where it is proposed that by the year 2030 there will be 600,000 electric vehicles circulating between taxis, passenger vehicles, light vehicles, light trucks, and official vehicles (CONPES 3934, 2018). The panorama is such that electric vehicles in Colombia went from less than 200 in 2011 to more than 38,000 vehicles among electric motorcycles, hybrid vehicles, plug-in hybrid vehicles, and battery electric vehicles at the end of 2021 (ANDEMOS, 2021). Antioquia, and in particular the Area Metropolitana del Valle de Aburrá, is the region with the most private electric vehicles registered in the country with approximately 24%, followed by Bogotá with 21%, Cundinamarca with 20% and Valle del Cauca with 14% (MinTransporte & RUNT, 2019).

The recent literature that studies issues related to the decarbonization of the transport sector has focused on the change of fuels and the transition towards electric mobility (Anandarajah et al., 2013; Babar et al., 2021; Bellocchi et al., 2018; Biresselioglu et al., 2018; Danielis et al., 2021; Govindarasu & Venkatesh, 2019; R. R. Kumar & Alok, 2020; Rajper & Albrecht, 2020). However, the decarbonization of the sector does not depend only on changing combustion sources, it also depends on the interaction of several factors and agents, including the share types of alternative fuel vehicles (Requia et al., 2018), as well as the development of infrastructure and modal changes (IEA, 2021). An integrative framework is needed to consider these interactions in the context of developing countries and modeling is a useful tool that provides a qualitative understanding of the system,

quantifies possible benefits, intervenes of the system without causing harm, and allows to warn decision-makers about the possibilities of action (Bellocchi et al., 2018). And, system dynamics is an appropriate methodology for developing an integrative framework, already used to model problems related to sustainability, including transport dynamics (Honti et al., 2019) because of using accumulating variables and flows, feedbacks, non-linearities, and time delays.

This research aims to diagnose the possible decarbonization trajectories of a Colombian metropolitan area and its effects in terms of GHG emissions avoided and additional electricity demand. The study is carried out at the metropolitan area level given that the diffusion of alternative energy source vehicles has advanced quite asymmetrically in the different territories of the country, and it has been identified that the importance of purchasing attributes differs between cities (Soto et al., 2018). The proposed model studies the private vehicle fleet of two categories: motorcycles and automobiles in the Area Metropolitan del Valle de Aburrá (AMVA) in Colombia. Each vehicle category has different vehicle propulsion options, either using traditional fossil fuels or using alternative combustion sources. Alternative combustion source vehicles, fuel cell vehicles, and natural gas vehicles (Martos et al., 2016). The model has four interconnected modules: 1) vehicle/motorcycle stock, 2) use of transport, 4) fueling points infrastructure, 5) electricity consumption, and 6) emissions.

The stock dynamics contemplates the purchase process. An individual will choose the technological alternative that maximizes his utility according to five characteristics, three negatives: initial investment, the operating costs, and the environmental factor (emissions); and two positives in utility: range and the new availability of infrastructure (fueling stations). Fueling stations will be required depending on the number of vehicles per technologies in the vehicle fleet, the emissions and electricity use of the vehicle fleet will be obtained. Stock dynamics also include the process of familiarization or social influence in the adoption of alternative combustion technologies. According to F. M. Bass (1969) the diffusion of new technologies is a process that occurs gradually, tracing what is known as an S-shaped curve that accelerates as more people adopt the new technology and it becomes more familiar to the social system. And once the potential market begins to run out because most people have decided to adopt the innovation, market saturation occurs, and the speed of adoption slows down.

People also make decisions regarding the use of transport, which in the model corresponds to the module of travel demand and modal split. Individuals will choose the transportation option that maximizes their utility, in this case, the individual will choose to use private, public, or non-motorized transportation, and then they choose whether to use a car, motorcycle, taxi, bus, metro, or a non-motorized mode (this category includes walking and cycling). The choice will depend on four attributes, two positives: access to the transport mode and the speed of the transport mode; and two negatives: waiting time and travel cost.

The results suggest that the modal split will follow a similar trend under a business-as-usual scenario (**Figure 1**), however, the reduction in operating costs of private modes such as motorcycles would make motorcycle trips exceed bus trips, for example. Therefore, the decarbonization of public transport systems should be parallel to the decarbonization of private transport. In this way, although the operating costs of private transport could maintain competitive tariffs.

Regarding the car fleet, we found that the protagonists by 2050 will be hybrid vehicles (HEV), with a percentage share of 48% (**Figure 2**). BEVs would have a 16% share and gasoline vehicles 32%. In the model, natural gas maintains a slow growth in the medium term but is picked up by electric vehicles, and hydrogen fuel cell vehicles are not competitive with electric vehicles under the scenario

business-as-usual. The advancement of one technology over another depends on the attributes that influence the consumer's decision; therefore, political decision-makers must study which are the most important attributes for consumers in the area studied and how these attributes can be improved through public policies and financial and non-financial incentives.

The simulation allows observing that it is possible to avoid 36.4 Mt of CO_2 (**Figure 3**) equivalent even in the business-as-usual scenario where incentives are still lacking and there are technical, financial, and cultural barriers towards alternative combustion vehicles in Colombia. This fact shows that the definition of adequate policies could increase the speed of the transition to sustainable mobility by intervening in the modal distribution of trips and the diffusion of vehicles with alternative propulsion sources. In addition, despite the results on the advancement of the mobility of alternative combustion sources, the structure of the model allows us to identify that the vehicles that are already in circulation have an inertial effect on the market, and replacement policies should be considered to accelerate the transition. Finally, alternative combustion vehicle diffusion, mainly electric vehicles, will bring about an increase in electricity demand of approximately 1,530 GWh per year (**Figure 3**), which shows the need to prepare the electricity sector for the entry of electric vehicles.



Figure 1. Modal distribution, AMVA.



Figure 2. Vehicles stock evolution.



Figure 3. Changes in electricity consumption and avoided emissions because of electric vehicles diffusion.

References

- Anandarajah, G., McDowall, W., & Ekins, P. (2013). Decarbonising road transport with hydrogen and electricity: Long term global technology learning scenarios. *International Journal of Hydrogen Energy*, 38(8), 3419–3432. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijhydene.2012.12.110
- ANDEMOS. (2018). ANDEMOS advierte sobre el envejecimiento de la población vehicular en Colombia.
- ANDEMOS. (2021). *Cifras y Estadisticas* . https://www.andemos.org/index.php/cifras-y-estadisticas-version-2/
- Ángel Reinemer, J. M. (2018). Evaluación de factores socioeconómicos y técnicos que afectan la aplicación del vehículo eléctrico en Colombia. Universidad de La Sabana.
- Ardila, L. A. (2014). *Evaluación de estrategias para incentivar un transporte particular bajo en carbono en Colombia*. 174. http://www.bdigital.unal.edu.co/39661/
- Babar, A. H. K., & Ali, Y. (2021). Enhancement of electric vehicles' market competitiveness using fuzzy quality function deployment. *Technological Forecasting and Social Change*, 167, 120738.
- Babar, A. H. K., Ali, Y., & Khan, A. U. (2021). Moving toward green mobility: overview and analysis of electric vehicle selection, Pakistan a case in point. *Environment, Development and Sustainability*, 23(7), 10994–11011.
- Barlas, Y. (1996). Formal Aspects of Model Validity and Validation in System Dynamics. *System Dynamics Review*, *12*(3), 183–210.
- Bass, F. (1969). A new product growth model for product diffusion. *Management Science*, 15(5), 215–227.
- Bass, F. M. (1969). A new product growth for model consumer durables. *Management Science*, 15(5), 215–227.
- Bedoya, L. F. (2017). Efectos del desarrollo tecnológico de las baterías en el Sistema Interconectado Nacional de Colombia. https://repositorio.unal.edu.co/handle/unal/60848
- Bellocchi, S., Gambini, M., Manno, M., Stilo, T., & Vellini, M. (2018). Positive interactions between electric vehicles and renewable energy sources in CO2-reduced energy scenarios: The Italian case. *Energy*, *161*, 172–182. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.energy.2018.07.068
- Bhutto, M. H., Tariq, B., Azhar, S., Ahmed, K., Khuwaja, F. M., & Han, H. (2020). Predicting consumer purchase intention toward hybrid vehicles: testing the moderating role of price sensitivity. *European Business Review*.
- BID. (2019). Electromovilidad. Panorama actual en América Latina y el Caribe. 16.
- Biresselioglu, M. E., Demirbag Kaplan, M., & Yilmaz, B. K. (2018). Electric mobility in Europe: A comprehensive review of motivators and barriers in decision making processes. *Transportation Research Part A: Policy and Practice*, 109, 1–13. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tra.2018.01.017
- Braz da Silva, M., & Moura, F. (2016). Electric vehicle diffusion in the Portuguese automobile market. *International Journal of Sustainable Transportation*, *10*(2), 49–64.
- Cascetta, E. (2009). *Transportation systems analysis: models and applications* (Vol. 29). Springer Science & Business Media.
- CONPES 3934. (2018). CONPES 3934 Política de crecimiento verde. https://colaboracion.dnp.gov.co/CDT/Conpes/Económicos/3934.pdf
- Danielis, R., Scorrano, M., & Giansoldati, M. (2021). Decarbonising transport in Europe: Trends, goals, policies and passenger car scenarios. *Research in Transportation Economics*, 101068. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.retrec.2021.101068
- Engerer, H., & Horn, M. (2010). Natural gas vehicles: An option for Europe. *Energy Policy*, 38(2), 1017–1029.
- Gaddam, H. K., & Rao, K. R. (2019). Speed-density functional relationship for heterogeneous

traffic data: a statistical and theoretical investigation. *Journal of Modern Transportation*, 27(1), 61–74.

Geroski, P. A. (2000). Models of technology diffusion. Research Policy, 29(4-5), 603-625.

- Gompertz, B. (1825). XXIV. On the nature of the function expressive of the law of human mortality, and on a new mode of determining the value of life contingencies. In a letter to Francis Baily, Esq. FRS &c. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London*, 115, 513–583.
- Govindarasu, A., & Venkatesh, A. S. (2019). Electric Vehicle Vision 2030 Challenges and Solutions. 2019 IEEE Transportation Electrification Conference (ITEC-India), 1–3.
- Gutiérrez, M., Cantillo, V., Arellana, J., & Ortúzar, J. de D. (2021). Estimating bicycle demand in an aggressive environment. *International Journal of Sustainable Transportation*, *15*(4), 259–272.
- Guzman, L. A., Arellana, J., & Alvarez, V. (2020). Confronting congestion in urban areas: Developing Sustainable Mobility Plans for public and private organizations in Bogotá. *Transportation Research Part A: Policy and Practice*, 134, 321–335.
- Guzman, L. A., Oviedo, D., Arellana, J., & Cantillo-García, V. (2021). Buying a car and the street: Transport justice and urban space distribution. *Transportation Research Part D: Transport* and Environment, 95, 102860.
- Haddad, M. G., Mansour, C. J., & Afif, C. (2018). Future trends and mitigation options for energy consumption and greenhouse gas emissions in a developing country of the Middle East Region: A case study of Lebanon's road transport sector. *Environmental Modeling & Assessment*, 23(3), 263–276.
- Hagen, J. X., Pardo, C., & Valente, J. B. (2016). Motivations for motorcycle use for Urban travel in Latin America: A qualitative study. *Transport Policy*, 49, 93–104.
- Haider, S. W., Zhuang, G., & Ali, S. (2019). Identifying and bridging the attitude-behavior gap in sustainable transportation adoption. *Journal of Ambient Intelligence and Humanized Computing*, 10(9), 3723–3738.
- Hamzah, M. I., Tanwir, N. S., Wahab, S. N., & Abd Rashid, M. H. (2021). Consumer perceptions of hybrid electric vehicle adoption and the green automotive market: the Malaysian evidence. *Environment, Development and Sustainability*, 1–25.
- Herrera, M. M., Hernández, A., & Velandia, C. (2019). Vista de una revisión de las contribuciones de la dinámica de sistemas en la transición de vehículos eléctricos. https://revistas.uniminuto.edu/index.php/Inventum/article/view/2204/1969
- Honti, G., Dörgő, G., & Abonyi, J. (2019). Review and structural analysis of system dynamics models in sustainability science. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 240, 118015. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2019.118015
- IDEAM, & PNUD. (2016). Inventario Nacional y Departamental de Gases Efecto Invernadero.
- IEA. (2018). Data and Statistics. Carbon intensity of industry energy consumption, World 1990-2017.
- IEA. (2019). Tracking Transport Analysis.
- IEA. (2020). Tracking Transport 2020, IEA, Paris. https://www.iea.org/reports/tracking-transport-2020
- IEA. (2021). Trends and developments in electric vehicle markets Global EV Outlook 2021. https://www.iea.org/reports/global-ev-outlook-2021/trends-and-developments-in-electric-vehicle-markets#abstract
- Jian, L., Snartum, A., & Yongqiang, Z. (2020). Implications of Road Transport Electrification: a long-term scenario-dependent analysis in China. *ETransportation*, 100072. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.etran.2020.100072
- Jochem, P., Gómez Vilchez, J. J., Ensslen, A., Schäuble, J., & Fichtner, W. (2018). Methods for forecasting the market penetration of electric drivetrains in the passenger car market. *Transport Reviews*, *38*(3), 322–348.

- Jones, L. R., Cherry, C. R., Vu, T. A., & Nguyen, Q. N. (2013). The effect of incentives and technology on the adoption of electric motorcycles: A stated choice experiment in Vietnam. *Transportation Research Part A: Policy and Practice*, 57, 1–11. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tra.2013.09.003
- Keith, D. R., Struben, J. J. R., & Naumov, S. (2020). The Diffusion of Alternative Fuel Vehicles: A Generalised Model and Future Research Agenda. *Journal of Simulation*, 14(4), 260–277. https://doi.org/10.1080/17477778.2019.1708219
- Kong, D., Xia, Q., Xue, Y., & Zhao, X. (2020). Effects of multi policies on electric vehicle diffusion under subsidy policy abolishment in China: A multi-actor perspective. *Applied Energy*, 266, 114887. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.apenergy.2020.114887
- Krishna, G. (2021). Understanding and identifying barriers to electric vehicle adoption through thematic analysis. *Transportation Research Interdisciplinary Perspectives*, *10*, 100364. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.trip.2021.100364
- Kumar, P., Singh, R. K., Paul, J., & Sinha, O. (2021). Analyzing challenges for sustainable supply chain of electric vehicle batteries using a hybrid approach of Delphi and Best-Worst Method. *Resources, Conservation and Recycling*, 175, 105879.
- Kumar, R. R., & Alok, K. (2020). Adoption of electric vehicle: A literature review and prospects for sustainability. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, 253, 119911. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2019.119911
- Kumar, R. R., Guha, P., & Chakraborty, A. (2022). Comparative assessment and selection of electric vehicle diffusion models: A global outlook. *Energy*, 238, 121932.
- Lee, J., Baig, F., Talpur, M. A. H., & Shaikh, S. (2021). Public Intentions to Purchase Electric Vehicles in Pakistan. *Sustainability*, *13*(10), 5523.
- Lemoine, P. D., Cordovez, J. M., Zambrano, J. M., Sarmiento, O. L., Meisel, J. D., Valdivia, J. A., & Zarama, R. (2016). Using agent based modeling to assess the effect of increased Bus Rapid Transit system infrastructure on walking for transportation. *Preventive Medicine*, 88, 39–45.
- Li, S., Xing, J., Yang, L., & Zhang, F. (2020). Transportation and the environment in developing countries. *Annual Review of Resource Economics*, *12*, 389–409.
- Li, X.-Y., Ge, J.-P., Chen, W.-Q., & Wang, P. (2019). Scenarios of rare earth elements demand driven by automotive electrification in China: 2018–2030. *Resources, Conservation and Recycling*, *145*, 322–331. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.resconrec.2019.02.003
- Liu, D., & Xiao, B. (2018). Exploring the development of electric vehicles under policy incentives: A scenario-based system dynamics model. *Energy Policy*, *120*, 8–23. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.enpol.2018.04.073
- Liu, R., Li, M. H., & Zhang, H. N. (2017). Opportunities and challenges of electric vehicles development in mitigating climate change in China. *IOP Conference Series: Earth and Environmental Science*, *86*(1), 12010.
- Lopes, M. M., Moura, F., & Martinez, L. M. (2014). A rule-based approach for determining the plausible universe of electric vehicle buyers in the Lisbon Metropolitan Area. *Transportation Research Part A: Policy and Practice*, 59, 22–36.
- Lopez-Arboleda, E., Sarmiento, A. T., & Cardenas, L. M. (2019). Systematic review of integrated sustainable transportation models for electric passenger vehicle diffusion. *Sustainability*, 11(9), 2513.
- Lopez-Arboleda, E., Sarmiento, A. T., & Cardenas, L. M. (2021). Understanding synergies between electric-vehicle market dynamics and sustainability: Case study of Colombia. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, *321*, 128834.
- Lopez, N. S., Soliman, J., Biona, J. B. M., & Fulton, L. (2020). Cost-benefit analysis of alternative vehicles in the Philippines using immediate and distant future scenarios. *Transportation Research Part D: Transport and Environment*, 82, 102308.
- Ma, S.-C., Xu, J.-H., & Fan, Y. (2019). Willingness to pay and preferences for alternative incentives to EV purchase subsidies: An empirical study in China. *Energy Economics*, *81*,

197–215.

- Martos, A., Pacheco-Torres, R., Ordóñez, J., & Jadraque-Gago, E. (2016). Towards successful environmental performance of sustainable cities: Intervening sectors. A review. *Renewable and Sustainable Energy Reviews*, *57*, 479–495. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.rser.2015.12.095
- McFadden, D. (1986). The choice theory approach to market research. *Marketing Science*, 5(4), 275–297.
- MinTransporte, & RUNT. (2019). Boletín de Prensa 003 de 2019 Mercado de eléctricos en aumento.
- Nakata, T., Silva, D., & Rodionov, M. (2011). Application of energy system models for designing a low-carbon society. *Progress in Energy and Combustion Science*, 37(4), 462–502.
- Ning, W., Guo, J., Liu, X., & Pan, H. (2020). Incorporating individual preference and network influence on choice behavior of electric vehicle sharing using agent-based model. *International Journal of Sustainable Transportation*, 14(12), 917–931.
- Ockwell, D. G., Watson, J., MacKerron, G., Pal, P., & Yamin, F. (2008). Key policy considerations for facilitating low carbon technology transfer to developing countries. *Energy Policy*, *36*(11), 4104–4115.
- Olascuaga, L. M. H., Garcia, J. A. R., & Pinzon, J. E. P. (2015). EVs mass adoption in Colombia— A first approach model. 2015 IEEE 15th International Conference on Environment and Electrical Engineering (EEEIC), 1285–1290.
- Peterson, S. (2008). Greenhouse gas mitigation in developing countries through technology transfer?: a survey of empirical evidence. *Mitigation and Adaptation Strategies for Global Change*, *13*(3), 283–305.
- Rajper, S. Z., & Albrecht, J. (2020). Prospects of electric vehicles in the developing countries: a literature review. *Sustainability*, 12(5), 1906.
- Requia, W. J., Mohamed, M., Higgins, C. D., Arain, A., & Ferguson, M. (2018). How clean are electric vehicles? Evidence-based review of the effects of electric mobility on air pollutants, greenhouse gas emissions and human health. *Atmospheric Environment*, 185, 64–77. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.atmosenv.2018.04.040
- Rogers, E. M. (1962). Diffusion of innovations. Free Press (NY). 1995.
- RUNT. (2021). Runt en cifras. https://www.runt.com.co/runt-en-cifras
- Sauer, I. L., Escobar, J. F., da Silva, M. F. P., Meza, C. G., Centurion, C., & Goldemberg, J. (2015). Bolivia and Paraguay: A beacon for sustainable electric mobility? *Renewable and Sustainable Energy Reviews*, 51, 910–925. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.rser.2015.06.038
- Schade, W., Kley, F., Köhler, J., & Peters, A. (2012). Contextual Requirements for Electric Vehicles in Developed and Developing Countries: The Example of China. In *Sustainable Transport for Chinese Cities*. Emerald Group Publishing Limited.
- Shepherd, S. P. (2014). A review of system dynamics models applied in transportation. *Transportmetrica B: Transport Dynamics*, 2(2), 83–105.
- Singh, D., Mahanta, G. B., & Deepak, B. (2020). A Systematic Approach to Identify the Critical Parameters of Two-Wheeler E-Vehicles. In *Innovative Product Design and Intelligent Manufacturing Systems* (pp. 229–240). Springer, Singapore.
- Soto, J. J., Cantillo, V., & Arellana, J. (2018). Incentivizing alternative fuel vehicles: the influence of transport policies, attitudes and perceptions. *Transportation*, 45(6), 1721–1753. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11116-018-9869-4
- Strapasson, A., Woods, J., Pérez-Cirera, V., Elizondo, A., Cruz-Cano, D., Pestiaux, J., Cornet, M., & Chaturvedi, R. (2020). Modelling carbon mitigation pathways by 2050: Insights from the Global Calculator. *Energy Strategy Reviews*, 29, 100494. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.esr.2020.100494
- Toro-González, D., Cantillo, V., & Cantillo-García, V. (2020). Factors influencing demand for public transport in Colombia. *Research in Transportation Business & Management*, 36, 100514.

Train, K. E. (2009). Discrete choice methods with simulation. Cambridge university press.

- UNFCCC. (2020). Actualización de la Contribución Determinada a Nivel Nacional de Colombia (NDC).
- UPME. (2019). *Plan Energetico Nacional 2020-2050*. 83. https://www1.upme.gov.co/DemandaEnergetica/UPME_Presentacion_PEN_V48.pdf
- UPME. (2020). Plan Energético Nacional 2020 2050.
- Urrutia-Mosquera, J., & Fábrega, J. (2021). Impact of fiscal incentives in the consumption of low emission vehicles. *Case Studies on Transport Policy*.
- Vilchez, J. J. G., & Jochem, P. (2019). Simulating vehicle fleet composition: A review of system dynamics models. *Renewable and Sustainable Energy Reviews*, 115, 109367.
- XM. (2022). Demanda de energía en 2021 marca máximos históricos. https://www.xm.com.co/noticias/4590-demanda-de-energia-en-2021-marca-maximoshistoricos
- Yamaguchi, N. (2010). Quantitative research on the diffusion speed of EV based on diffusion process analysis of new consumer electronics products. *World Electric Vehicle Journal*, 4(4), 846–854.